

# Plenary

---

Meeting date:  
**Wednesday, 22 June 2011**

Meeting time:  
**13:30**

Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru  
National  
Assembly for  
Wales



## Votes and Proceedings

(8)

---

### **1. Finance Questions to the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House**

The first 12 questions were answered.

**14.19**

### **2. Questions to the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science**

The first 14 questions were answered. Question 7 was transferred for written answer by the Minister for Education and Skills.

**15.06**

### **POINT OF ORDER**

The Minister for Education and Skills, Leighton Andrews, raised a point of Order under Standing Order 13.9 to request that Antoinette Sandbach withdraw her comments during questions that the Minister had not visited Glyndŵr University since becoming Minister, a point which he refuted. The Presiding Officer allowed the point of order, Antoinette Sandbach withdrew her comments.

**15.09**

### **3. Statement by the Minister for Local Government and Communities: The Boundary Commission**

**15.22**

### **MOTION TO SUSPEND STANDING ORDERS**

### **NDM4758 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

That the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders 33.6 and 33.8:

Suspends Standing Order 12.20 (i) and that part of Standing Order 11.16 that requires the weekly announcement under Standing Order 11.11 to constitute the timetable for business in Plenary for the following week, to allow the motions under item 4 to be considered in Plenary on Wednesday 22 June 2011.

**The motion was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.**

**15.23**

#### **4. Motions to establish committees**

##### **NNDM4749 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes a Children and Young People Committee to carry out the functions set out in that Standing Order.

##### **NNDM4750 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes an Environment and Sustainability Committee to carry out the functions set out in that Standing Order.

##### **NNDM4751 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes a Health and Social Care Committee to carry out the functions set out in that Standing Order.

##### **NNDM4752 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes a Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee to carry out the functions set out in that Standing Order.

##### **NNDM4753 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes an Enterprise and Business Committee to carry out the functions set out in that Standing Order.

##### **NNDM4754 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes a Finance Committee to carry out the functions of the responsible committee set out in Standing Order 19.

##### **NNDM4755 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes a Public Accounts Committee to carry out the functions of the responsible committee set out in Standing Order 18.

##### **NNDM4756 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.1, establishes a Standards of Conduct Committee to carry out the functions of the responsible committee set out in Standing Order 22.

#### **NNDM4757 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

The National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.3, agrees that the Committee on Statutory Instruments established on 15 June 2011 is retitled the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee. The remit of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee is to carry out the functions of the responsible committee set out in Standing Order 21 and to consider any other constitutional or governmental matter within or relating to the competence of the Assembly or Welsh Ministers.

**The motions were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.**

**15.23**

#### **5. Motions to elect Members to committees**

#### **NNDM4759 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.14, elects Joyce Watson (Labour) as a member of the Petitions Committee in place of Christine Chapman (Labour).

#### **NNDM4760 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects William Powell (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as Chair of the Petitions Committee.

#### **NNDM4761 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects Antoinette Sandbach (Welsh Conservatives) as a member of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee.

#### **NNDM4762 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Christine Chapman (Labour), Keith Davies (Labour), Julie Morgan (Labour), Lynne Neagle (Labour), Jenny Rathbone (Labour), Angela Burns (Welsh Conservatives), Suzy Davies (Welsh Conservatives), Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru), Simon Thomas (Plaid Cymru) and Kirsty Williams (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Children and Young People Committee; and
- (ii) Christine Chapman as Chair of the Children and Young People Committee.

#### **NNDM4763 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Mick Antoniw (Labour), Rebecca Evans (Labour), Vaughan Gething (Labour), Julie James (Labour), David Rees (Labour), Antoinette Sandbach (Welsh Conservatives), Russell George (Welsh Conservatives), Dafydd Elis-Thomas (Plaid Cymru), Llyr Huws Gruffydd (Plaid Cymru) and William Powell (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Environment and Sustainability Committee; and
- (ii) Dafydd Elis-Thomas as Chair of the Environment and Sustainability Committee.

**NNDM4764 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Mick Antoniw (Labour), Mark Drakeford (Labour), Rebecca Evans (Labour), Vaughan Gething (Labour), Lynne Neagle (Labour), Darren Millar (Welsh Conservatives), Janet Finch-Saunders (Welsh Conservatives), Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru), Lindsay Whittle (Plaid Cymru) and Kirsty Williams (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Health and Social Care Committee; and
- (ii) Mark Drakeford as Chair of the Health and Social Care Committee.

**NNDM4765 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Mike Hedges (Labour), Ann Jones (Labour), Gwyn Price (Labour), Ken Skates (Labour), Joyce Watson (Labour), Mark Isherwood (Welsh Conservatives), William Graham (Welsh Conservatives), Bethan Jenkins (Plaid Cymru), Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) and Peter Black (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee; and
- (ii) Ann Jones as Chair of the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee.

**NNDM4766 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Keith Davies (Labour), Julie James (Labour), David Rees (Labour), Ken Skates (Labour), Joyce Watson (Labour), Andrew RT Davies (Welsh Conservatives), Byron Davies (Welsh Conservatives), Alun Ffred Jones (Plaid Cymru), Leanne Wood (Plaid Cymru) and William Powell (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Enterprise and Business Committee; and
- (ii) Andrew RT Davies as Chair of the Enterprise and Business Committee.

**NNDM4767 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Christine Chapman (Labour), Julie Morgan (Labour), Ann Jones (Labour), Mike Hedges (Labour), Nick Ramsay (Welsh Conservatives), Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru), Ieuan Wyn Jones (Plaid Cymru) and Peter Black (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Finance Committee; and
- (ii) Jocelyn Davies as Chair of the Finance Committee.

**NNDM4768 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Mike Hedges (Labour), Gwyn Price (Labour), Jenny Rathbone (Labour), Julie Morgan (Labour), Darren Millar (Welsh Conservatives), Mohammad Asghar (Welsh Conservatives), Leanne Wood (Plaid Cymru) and Peter Black (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Public Accounts Committee; and
- (ii) Darren Millar as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee.

**NNDM4769 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

- (i) Mick Antoniw (Labour), Mark Isherwood (Welsh Conservatives), Llyr Huws Gruffydd (Plaid Cymru) and Kirsty Williams (Welsh Liberal Democrats) as members of the Standards of Conduct Committee; and
- (ii) Mick Antoniw as Chair of the Standards of Conduct Committee.

**The motions were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.**

**15.23**

**6. Welsh Conservatives Debate**

**Voting on the motion and amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.**

A vote was taken on the motion without amendment:

**NDM4742 Nick Ramsay (Monmouthshire)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Calls on the Welsh Government to:

- a) Undertake a public review of Technical Advice Note (TAN) 8: Renewable Energy (2005) which should include the implications for transportation, the environment, health and construction of implementing the guidance;

b) Support a moratorium on the construction of all wind farm developments, excluding micro generation schemes and projects that have clear community support, in the Strategic Search Areas (SSAs) until the review of Tan 8 is completed; and

c) Promote a wide range of renewable sources to minimise the impact of individual renewable electricity schemes.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
15	0	39	54

**The motion without amendment was not agreed.**

**The following amendments were tabled:**

#### **Amendment 1 - Jocelyn Davies (South East Wales)**

Insert as new point 1 and renumber accordingly:

Invites the responsible committee to undertake an inquiry into the environmental and energy effectiveness of Welsh Government Planning and Renewable Energy policy and to report within three months of the start of the Autumn term.

A vote was taken on Amendment 1:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
26	0	28	54

**Amendment 1 was not agreed.**

#### **Amendment 2 - Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)**

Delete point 1a

A vote was taken on Amendment 2:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
39	0	15	54

**Amendment 2 was agreed.**

#### **Amendment 3 - Jane Hutt (Bro Morgannwg)**

Delete point 1b

A vote was taken on Amendment 3:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
39	0	15	54

**Amendment 3 was agreed.**

#### **Amendment 4 - Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Add as a new point at end of motion:

Regrets that the First Minister's written statement on 17th June did not include a commitment to revise TAN 8.

A vote was taken on Amendment 4:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
-----	---------	---------	-------

15	0	39	54
----	---	----	----

**Amendment 4 was not agreed.**

### **Amendment 5 - Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Add as a new point at end of motion:

Believes that a greater mix of renewable energy sources, including offshore wind, tidal and microgeneration would reduce Wales' need for significant increases in onshore wind capacity.

A vote was taken on Amendment 5:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
43	0	11	54

**Amendment 5 was agreed.**

**A vote was taken on the motion as amended:**

**NDM4742**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Calls on the Welsh Government to promote a wide range of renewable sources to minimise the impact of individual renewable electricity schemes.

Believes that a greater mix of renewable energy sources, including offshore wind, tidal and microgeneration would reduce Wales' need for significant increases in onshore wind capacity.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
51	3	0	54

**The motion as amended was agreed.**

16.26

### **7. Welsh Conservatives Debate**

**Voting on the motion and amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.**

A vote was taken on the motion without amendment:

**NDM4743 Nick Ramsay (Monmouthshire)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Welcomes the report by the Wales Audit Office on Major Transport Projects (2011);
2. Notes with concern that many transport projects have 'cost substantially more and taken longer to complete than expected';
3. Calls for the Welsh Government to ensure that funding for transport projects is used in an efficient and effective way.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
16	0	38	54

**The motion without amendment was not agreed.**

**The following amendments were tabled:**

**Amendment 1 - Jocelyn Davies (South East Wales)**

Add as new point after point 2 and renumber accordingly:

Welcomes the improved financial control of transport projects managed by the Welsh Government and by local authorities in recent years.

A vote was taken on Amendment 1:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
39	0	15	54

**Amendment 1 was agreed.**

**Amendment 2 - Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Add as new point at end of motion:

Believes that it is essential to keep transport projects within budget in order to ensure that other much-needed projects can go ahead.

A vote was taken on Amendment 2:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
53	0	0	53

**Amendment 2 was agreed.**

**A vote was taken on the motion as amended:**

**NDM4743**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Welcomes the report by the Wales Audit Office on Major Transport Projects (2011);
2. Notes with concern that many transport projects have 'cost substantially more and taken longer to complete than expected';
3. Welcomes the improved financial control of transport projects managed by the Welsh Government and by local authorities in recent years.
4. Calls for the Welsh Government to ensure that funding for transport projects is used in an efficient and effective way.
5. Believes that it is essential to keep transport projects within budget in order to ensure that other much-needed projects can go ahead.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
42	0	12	54

**The motion as amended was agreed.**



17.28

## 8. Plaid Cymru Debate

**Voting on the motion and amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.**

A vote was taken on the motion without amendment:

### **NDM4741 Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

The National Assembly calls on the Welsh Government to facilitate the setting up of a not-for-distributable-profit company to raise capital for infrastructure projects.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
11	0	43	54

**The motion without amendment was not agreed.**

**The following amendments were tabled:**

### **Amendment 1 - Nick Ramsay (Monmouthshire)**

Delete all and replace with:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Calls on the Welsh Government to:

- a) Consider all opportunities to raise capital for infrastructure projects; and
- b) Ensure greater cost analysis of major construction projects to achieve greater budget responsibility and deliver timely results.

A vote was taken on Amendment 1:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
40	0	14	54

**Amendment 1 was agreed.**

**As amendment 1 was agreed, amendments 2, 3 and 4 were deselected.**

### **Amendment 2 - Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Delete 'calls on the Welsh Government to facilitate the setting up of' and replace with 'is concerned about the lack of detail available for'.

### **Amendment 3 - Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)**

Delete all after "Welsh Government to" and replace with:

“explore innovative, collaborative ways in which the Welsh Government and others, such as local authorities and the private sector, can manage assets and raise capital for investment in public service infrastructure, and continue to explore other, sustainable and flexible forms of investment in public services.”

### **Amendment 4 - Peter Black (South Wales West)**

After 'projects', insert 'but calls on the Welsh government to examine the feasibility for such a scheme within the current financial devolution settlement.'

#### **Amendment 5 - Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Add as new point at end of motion:

Recognises that to be in a stronger position to raise capital for infrastructure projects, greater fiscal autonomy for Wales is needed.

A vote was taken on Amendment 5:

<b>For</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>43</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>54</b>

**Amendment 5 was agreed.**

**A vote was taken on the motion as amended:**

**NDM4741**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Calls on the Welsh Government to:

- a) Consider all opportunities to raise capital for infrastructure projects; and
- b) Ensure greater cost analysis of major construction projects to achieve greater budget responsibility and deliver timely results.

2. Recognises that to be in a stronger position to raise capital for infrastructure projects, greater fiscal autonomy for Wales is needed.

<b>For</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>53</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>54</b>

**The motion as amended was agreed.**

**18.14**

**Voting Time**

The meeting concluded at 18.21.

**The Assembly will sit again at Plenary at 13:30 on Tuesday, 28 June 2011**